aNNU



**AGENDA**

**Audit Committee Meeting**

**Monday, 17 March 2025**

**Notice of Meeting**

**To Mayor & Councillors**

A Meeting of the Audit Committee of the City of Nedlands is to be held on Monday, 17 March 2025 in the Council chambers at 71 Stirling Highway Nedlands commencing at 5.30pm.

This meeting will be livestreamed - [Livestreaming Council & Committee Meetings » City of Nedlands](https://www.nedlands.wa.gov.au/council/council-meetings/livestreaming-council-committee-meetings.aspx)

A close-up of a signature

Description automatically generated

**Keri Shannon | Chief Executive Officer**

**10 March 2025**

**Information**

Audit Committee Meetings are run in accordance with the City of Nedlands Standing Orders Local Law. If you have any questions in relation to items on the agenda, procedural matters, public question time, addressing the Committee or attending meetings please contact the Governance Officer on 9273 3500.

**Public Question Time**

Public question time at an Audit Committee Meeting is available for members of the public to ask a question about items on the agenda. Questions asked by members of the public are not to be accompanied by any statement reflecting adversely upon any Council Member, Committee Member or Employee.

Questions should be submitted as early as possible via the online form available on the City’s website: [Public question time | City of Nedlands](https://www.nedlands.wa.gov.au/public-question-time)

Questions may be taken on notice to allow adequate time to prepare a response and all answers will be published in the minutes of the meeting.

**Addresses by Members of the Public**

Members of the public wishing to address Council in relation to an item on the agenda must complete the online registration form available on the City’s website: [Public Address Registration Form | City of Nedlands](https://www.nedlands.wa.gov.au/public-address-registration-form)

The Presiding Member will determine the order of speakers to address the Council and the number of speakers is to be limited to 2 in support and 2 against any item on an Audit Committee Meeting Agenda. The Public address session will be restricted to 15 minutes unless the Council, by resolution decides otherwise.

**Disclaimer**

Members of the public who attend Audit Committee Meetings should not act immediately on anything they hear at the meetings, without first seeking clarification of Council’s position. For example, by reference to the confirmed Minutes of Council meeting. Members of the public are also advised to wait for written advice from the Council prior to acting on any matter that they may have before Council.

Any plans or documents in agendas and minutes may be subject to copyright. The express permission of the copyright owner must be obtained before copying any copyright material.

**Table of Contents**

[1. Declaration of Opening 4](#_Toc192520738)

[2. Present and Apologies and Leave of Absence (Previously Approved) 4](#_Toc192520739)

[3. Public Question Time 4](#_Toc192520740)

[4. Address by Members of the Public 4](#_Toc192520741)

[5. Disclosures of Financial Interest 4](#_Toc192520742)

[6. Disclosures of Interest Affecting Impartiality 4](#_Toc192520743)

[7. Declaration by Members That They Have Not Given Due Consideration to Papers 5](#_Toc192520744)

[8. Confirmation of Minutes 5](#_Toc192520745)

[9. Finance 6](#_Toc192520746)

[9.1. ARC 58.03.25 External Audit – key correspondence, audit preparation, and status of FY23 audit findings 6](#_Toc192520747)

[9.2 ARC 59.03.25 Internal Audit Update 10](#_Toc192520748)

[10. CONFIDENTIAL – Information, Communication & Technology 17](#_Toc192520749)

[10.1 ARC 60.03.25 Annual External Financial Controls Audit – ICT Findings Update (Confidential) 17](#_Toc192520750)

[11. Any Other Business 17](#_Toc192520751)

[12. Date of Next Meeting 17](#_Toc192520752)

[13. Declaration of Closure 17](#_Toc192520753)

# Declaration of Opening

The Presiding Member will declare the meeting open at 5.30 pm and acknowledge the Whadjuk Nyoongar people, Traditional Custodians of the land on which we meet, and pay respect to Elders past, present and emerging. The Presiding Member will draw attention to the disclaimer on page 2 and advise the meeting is being livestreamed.

# Present and Apologies and Leave of Absence (Previously Approved)

**Leave of Absence** Cr Hodsdon

**(Previously Approved)**

**Apologies** None as at distribution of this agenda.

# Public Question Time

Public questions submitted to be read at this point.

# Address by Members of the Public

Addresses by members of the public who have completed Public Address Registration Forms to be made at this point.

# Disclosures of Financial Interest

The Presiding Member will remind Council Members and Staff of the requirements of Section 5.65 of the Local Government Act to disclose any interest during the meeting when the matter is discussed.

A declaration under this section requires that the nature of the interest must be disclosed. Consequently, a member who has made a declaration must not preside, participate in, or be present during any discussion or decision-making procedure relating to the matter the subject of the declaration.

However, other members may allow participation of the declarant if the member further discloses the extent of the interest. Any such declarant who wishes to participate in the meeting on the matter, shall leave the meeting, after making their declaration and request to participate, while other members consider and decide upon whether the interest is trivial or insignificant or is common to a significant number of electors or ratepayers.

# Disclosures of Interest Affecting Impartiality

The Presiding Member reminded Council Members and Staff of the requirements of Council’s Code of Conduct in accordance with Section 5.103 of the Local Government Act.

Council Members and staff are required, in addition to declaring any financial interests to declare any interest that may affect their impartiality in considering a matter. This declaration does not restrict any right to participate in or be present during the decision-making procedure.

The following pro forma declaration is provided to assist in making the disclosure.

"With regard to the matter in item x ….. I disclose that I have an association with the applicant (or person seeking a decision). This association is ….. (nature of the interest).

Consequently, there may be a perception that my impartiality on the matter may be affected. I declare that I will consider this matter on its merits and vote accordingly."

The member or employee is encouraged to disclose the nature of the association.

# Declaration by Members That They Have Not Given Due Consideration to Papers

Members who have not read the business papers to make declarations at this point.

# Confirmation of Minutes

The Minutes of the Audit Committee 17 February 2025 are to be accepted as a true and correct record of that meeting.

# Finance

## ARC 58.03.25 External Audit – key correspondence, audit preparation, and status of FY23 audit findings

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Meeting & Date | Audit Committee Meeting – 17 March 2025 |
| **Applicant** | City of Nedlands |
| **Employee Disclosure under section 5.70 Local Government Act 1995** | Employee disclosure required where there is an interest in any matter of which the employee is providing advice or a report. |
| **Report Author** | C. Ross – Financial Services Consultant |
| **CEO** | K. Shannon |
| **Attachments** | 1. FY23 OAG findings remediation status |

**Purpose**

This report is for the Audit Committee to be updated on key correspondence and preparation relating to the audit of the City’s financial report for the year ended 30 June 2024.

As the City received a Disclaimer of Opinion for the 30 June 2023 financial report, the Audit Committee have also requested updates on the progress towards remediation of OAG audit findings.

**Recommendation**

That the Audit Committee RECEIVES the report.

**Voting Requirement**

Simple majority

**Background**

**1. 30 June 2024 audit readiness**

The 30 June 2024 draft financial report was provided to OAG/RSM on 9 December 2024, in line with the extension granted by DLGSC.

The 30 June 2024 final audit fieldwork phase visit commenced on 10 March 2025 and is scheduled for a period of two weeks. The finance team prepared the supporting documentation request list for submission prior to the start of the audit visit.

An updated draft of the 30 June 2024 financial report has been prepared. Adjustments to the draft financial report relates to depreciation adjustments, building impairment, accruals, reclassification and format disclosure updates.

**2. OAG/RSM meeting 26 February 2025**

On 26 February 2025 a meeting was held with representatives from OAG/RSM, administration, all Councilors were invited with Mayor Argyle, Deputy Mayor Smyth and Cr Coghlan in attendance, to discuss matters related to the 30 June 2024 financial report and provided an opportunity to directly discuss audit issues with OAG.

At the meeting, high level feedback was provided by OAG on the 30 June 2024 financial report and impact on the audit opinion relating to the re-work required on the form and presentation of the opening balances due to the disclaimer of audit opinion at 30 June 2023.

**3. Practicability assessment**

The compilation of supporting documentation by the finance team and audit team of the 30 June 2023 opening balances has been a time-consuming exercise and has required OAG/RSM to work collaboratively with the City in a number of areas, however a number of supporting records are missing resulting in a lack of confidence in the integrity of the data.  A substantial component of time has been spent on fixed assets and infrastructure assets.

A practicability assessment has now been made by the City in accordance with AASB 108 *Accounting Policies, Changes in Accounting Estimates and Errors*, as changes to past financial records can only be made if there is sufficient evidence and supporting documentation available.

Unfortunately, crucial records and supporting information from prior years are missing and the underlying records are inaccessible. The City has had the finance team of eight staff working for three months attempting to substantiate and confirm the finance records. Where substantiating records were located, the errors identified were throughout the balance sheet. Without these key documents, it is not possible to amend or correct the 30 June 2023 financial report with the requisite level of reliability and assurance regarding the integrity of the data in order to resolve the disclaimer of opinion. As such, retrospectively restating these records is not a practical solution.

Additionally, Auditing Standard ASA 710 *- Comparative Information-Corresponding Figures and Comparative Financial Reports*, indicates it is the responsibility of the City’s management to ensure that financial information is comparable across reporting periods. However poor past working practices at the City mean essential underlying data is missing or was not attached to the journals and can no longer be retrieved, and it is therefore unfeasible to amend past records to restore the required level of comparability and confidence. After significant work to reconstruct and confirm records, the City considers the necessary data cannot be obtained or reconstructed, and making it impossible to resolve the disclaimer of opinion for the previous year.

The challenges in addressing the disclaimer of opinion for the 30 June 2023 financial report are primarily due to the following factors:

1. Unavailability of historical records

Many critical documents and records from prior years are no longer readily available due to the City’s document retention practices. As a result, it has been impractical to retrieve the necessary supporting information to amend the past financial records.

2. Change in ERP system

In some instances, the brought forward balances from the legacy ERP system were not appropriately reconciled which created further gaps and complications in the effort to reconstruct missing or incomplete records from earlier periods.

3. Key Management Personnel and key finance staff

The finance department has experienced significant turnover, with key staff, including the CEO, CFO, and all City Directors, having only been in their roles for six months or less. Furthermore the record keeping practices were poorly organised meaning when personnel left the City and were replaced the new workforce lack the corporate knowledge to locate or reconstruct the missing records.

Due to the constraints in retrospectively restating records, OAG indicated expectations at the meeting on 26 February 2025 for the City to receive qualified opinion paragraphs on comparative figures, and for completeness and accuracy of restated comparative amounts and disclosures for the prior period corrections in the 30 June 2024 financial report.

Given the challenges outlined above, the City has focused on improving its financial reporting processes moving forward and addressing the issues raised during the audit and continues to implement proper work practices and processes. Corrective measures and improved practices and processes have been implemented to prevent similar issues from arising in future reporting periods. Specifically, the City has implemented:

* Enhanced record-keeping and document retention policies to ensure that essential financial data is preserved for future reference and audits
* Strengthened the ERP implementation team to facilitate a robust process to retrieve and reconstruct historical financial information if needed
* Recruited skilled team members with strong accounting and systems experience and analysts
* Succession planning and cross-functional training introduced throughout the Corporate Services Directorate.

**4. 30 June 2023 OAG findings**

There has been no significant changes in the open items relating to the FY23 OAG findings from the spreadsheet presented at the previous meeting of 17 Febraury 2025.The following items remain open at March 2025.

1.5b. Preparation of infrastructure Asset Masterfile for OneCouncil implementation and financial reporting purposes is delayed pending resource reallocation

4. Bank signatories have ongoing updates in progress due to staff changes

6. New Systems Accountant recruitment underway to assist the Financial Services team in OneCouncil extraction of information, implementation and training

8. Matching debtors against the respective debtor invoices to be addressed in OneCouncil Phase 3 Revenue (Debtors)

12. Contract variation policy changes in progress

14. Manual input of fees and charges for invoicing is to be addressed in OneCouncil Phase 3 Revenue (Debtors)

15. Record of verbal quotations is in progress

**5. Staffing**

The recruitment of the CFO position has been finalised with a commencement date of 7 April 2025. The Accounting Services Coordinator is currently assuming acting CFO duties.

**Discussion**

Nil

**Decision Implications**

Nil

**Conclusion**

The discussion will be noted.

## ARC 59.03.25 Internal Audit Update

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| 1. Meeting & Date | Audit Committee Meeting – 17 March 2025 |
| **Applicant** | City of Nedlands |
| **Employee Disclosure under section 5.70 Local Government Act 1995** | Employee disclosure required where there is an interest in any matter of which the employee is providing advice or a report. |
| **Report Author** | C. Ross - Financial Services Consultant |
| **CEO** | K. Shannon |
| **Attachments** |  |

**Purpose**

This report provides details on the proposed scope of work for Audit Committee consideration for Internal Audit services prior to seeking a public Request for Tender (RFT).

**Recommendation**

That Council APPROVE the proposed description of the scope for inclusion in the RFT for the City’s Internal Audit services

**Voting Requirement**

Simple majority

**Background**

The City’s objectives for the procurement of the internal audit function are to:

(a) Establish an effective and independent internal audit function that enhances good governance and accountability

(b) Facilitate the development of an internal audit charter and three-year internal audit plan

(c) Deliver an internal audit function that provides timely and useful information to the CEO and the Audit Committee, and drives continuous improvement

(d) Improve the effectiveness of risk management, internal control and governance processes within the City

Once appointed, the successful service provider will be required to develop an internal audit charter and develop the City’s three-year internal audit plan in conjunction with the City as a first phase. The second phase requires the implementation of the plan to deliver and perform the internal audit program as outlined in the internal audit plan for a period of three years, communicating findings and recommendations to the Audit Committee on the outcomes of internal audits, and attending Audit Committee meetings as required.

Administration is seeking agreement from the Audit Committee regarding the internal audit scope prior to issuing a RFT as the internal auditor has a functional reporting relationship to the Audit Committee, and as requested at the Audit Committee meeting of 17 February 2025.

**Discussion**

Local governments have recognised the need to improve their internal auditing processes and have moved to either employ an internal auditor or contract out the internal audit function.

The City has chosen to contract out the internal audit function, which included Moore Australia being appointed as the City’s Internal Auditor from 1 July 2018 to 30 June 2020, with an extension to 30 June 2024.

For local government, the internal auditor should report functionally to the Audit Committee and administratively to the CEO. Pursuant to section 5.41 of the *LG Act*, the CEO is responsible for the day-to-day management of council activities including the direction of staff and implicitly the internal audit function.

Local governments that do not establish an internal audit process still have the requirement to review the appropriateness and effectiveness of financial management systems and procedures regularly, and in relation to risk management, internal control and legislative compliance, and a review conducted not less than once in every three years in accordance with 5(2)(c) and 17 of the *Local Government (Financial Management) Regulations*.

In alignment with the City’s Procurement Policy, a minimum of three written quotes is being sought for the engagement of a consultant to provide Internal Audit services and it is recommended that a publicly advertised tender request be issued.

**1. Prescribed format of tender response**

The proposed outline of the instructions for the submission of responses is to include:

(a) An executive summary of the proposal

(b) Experience of similar local government engagements to support capability and experience

(c) Details on who will provide the internal audit services and resumes of key personnel detailing qualifications and experience

(d) A fixed price quotation for Internal Audit assurance services as indicated in the Section 2.1 table, over a three-year period

(e) Indicative rate card costs by staff grade for ad hoc Consulting and Value-added services

(f) Two referees who are current or recent clients in the local government sector

(g) Any assumptions with the proposal or the City’s requirements

**2. Description of services**

The scope of internal audit services embraces the wider concepts of corporate governance and risk, recognising that controls exist in the City to manage risks and promote effective and efficient governance and performance, with the proposed audit coverage over three years from 1 July 2025 to 30 June 2028.

The types of internal audit services sought by the City are for Assurance Services, and Consulting and Value-added Services.

**2.1 Assurance Services**

The City is looking to undertake as a minimum two Internal Audits per annum for a three-year period depending on the Council budget approval (coverage of low, medium, high). A terms of reference will be developed for each internal audit. Respondents will be requested to complete the following table.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Minimum two Internal Audits (low budget)** | **Year One** | **Year Two** | **Year Three** |
| Develop a three-year strategic program of internal audits in line with internal auditing standards and audit charter | $ |  |  |
| Develop an annual internal audit plan | $ | $ | $ |
| Deliver two internal audits per annum as identified in the three-year program of works | $ | $ | $ |
| Internal Audit log status maintenance | $ | $ | $ |
| **Sub-total $** | $ | $ | $ |
| **Total for years 1 to 3** | $ |  |  |

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Incremental delivery of additional two Internal Audits (medium budget)** | **Year One** | **Year Two** | **Year Three** |
| Incremental delivery of two additional internal audits per annum (including internal audit log maintenance) | $ | $ | $ |
| **Sub-total $** | $ | $ | $ |
| **Total for years 1 to 3** | $ |  |  |

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Grand total for years 1 to 3** | $ |  |  |

**2.2** **Consulting and Value-added Internal Audit Services ad-hoc basis (high budget),**

The nature and scope to be agreed upon and which are intended to add value and improve business operations, particularly in ICT and ERP implementation areas. A rate card by proposed grade of staff is to be provided on an hourly basis.

**3. Responsibilities**

The internal audit service provider will develop a three-year Strategic Internal Audit Plan to facilitate coverage from the available contract amount.

The contract encompasses internal audit planning, conducting internal audit engagements, attendance at Audit Committee meetings to present internal audit report and findings, and other associated duties.

To assist respondents to prepare their response, the following table shows a responsibility matrix as to who is responsible for the various internal audit related tasks at the City.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Internal Audit Tasks** |  |  |
| **Task** | **In-house** | **Service provider** |
| **Audit Committee** |  |  |
| Preparation of Audit Committee agendas and papers | 🗸 |  |
| Preparation of Internal Audit summary report for each Audit Committee meeting | 🗸 |  |
| Submission of final internal audit reports to the Audit Committee |  | 🗸 |
| Attendance at Audit Committee meeting to present internal audit report | 🗸 | 🗸 |
| **Internal Audit planning** |  |  |
| Provide input to the annual Internal Audit Plan including ongoing monitoring of risks and their application to the Internal Audit Plan | 🗸 | 🗸 |
| Prepare the three-year Internal Audit Plan |  | 🗸 |
| Development of an Assurance Map including assessment of residual risk |  | 🗸 |
| Co-ordination of audits across the City including staff availability | 🗸 |  |
| **Internal Audit engagements** |  |  |
| Plan internal audit engagements, prepare terms of reference, and arrange meetings |  | 🗸 |
| Conduct internal audit engagements |  | 🗸 |
| Prepare draft internal audit reports |  | 🗸 |
| Review draft internal audit reports | 🗸 | 🗸 |
| Submit management responses on internal audit findings | 🗸 |  |
| Prepare final internal audit reports |  | 🗸 |
| Review final internal audit reports | 🗸 | 🗸 |
| Issue final internal audit reports |  | 🗸 |
| **Internal Audit findings log** |  |  |
| Maintain audit findings and recommendations database (including in PPLGS module once implemented) | 🗸 |  |
| Monitor/follow-up validation of findings and recommendations and summary progress reports to the Audit Committee | 🗸 | 🗸 |
| **Measurement of Internal Audit performance** |  |  |
| Key performance indicators put in place to demonstrate level of performance | 🗸 | 🗸 |

**4 Performance in accordance with Professional Practice**

The internal audit services are to be delivered in accordance with:

a) the Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Auditing issued by the Institute of Internal Auditors

b) relevant professional standards of conduct

**5. Disclosure of service provider resource mix and skills**

The resource mix set as guidance in conducting the internal audit services:

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Staff member** | **Experience** | **Percentage of input from staff member** |
| Partner/Director | >12 years of experience | Minimum 10% |
| Senior Manager/Manager | >6 years of experience | Minimum 25% |
| Senior | >4 years of experience |  |
| Consultant/Analyst | >1 years of experience |  |

The internal audit service provider and its specified personnel to have a full range of skills to provide the internal audit services:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Skill area** | **Partner/ Director** | **Senior Manager/ Manager** | **Senior** |
| Internal audit | 🗸 | 🗸 | 🗸 |
| Experience working with local government | 🗸 | 🗸 | 🗸 |
| Risk management, control and compliance | 🗸 | 🗸 | 🗸 |
| Governance | 🗸 | 🗸 | 🗸 |
| Operational auditing and performance improvement | 🗸 | 🗸 | 🗸 |
| ICT / ERP implementation | 🗸 | 🗸` |  |

**6 Evaluation criteria**

The following criteria will be used when considering proposals:

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Scoring of proposals** |  |
| Meeting the requirements of the RFT including internal audit methodology to be used in performance of the services | 30% |
| Demonstrated skills and expertise of key personnel and relevant experience with local government | 30% |
| Cost and value for money | 30% |
| Comments and opinions of the referees provided | 10% |

**7 Professional referees**

Respondents to the RFT to provide contact details for two professional referees where they have effectively provided internal audit services for recent local government sector clients.

**OTHER MATTERS**

**8 Addressing previously identified open internal audit findings**

Subject to staff resource constraints, the City administration is currently reviewing the high risk outstanding internal audit recommendations identified. The focus being on areas where gaps in controls, processes, or compliance were identified to strengthen overall governance and reduce residual risks in advance of developing the three-year strategic program of internal audits.

**9 PPLGS module implementation**

In prior years the City’s internal audit issues log and validation status was maintained externally on a spreadsheet by Moore Australia with review and oversight responsibility by the Director Corporate Services.

In August 2023 the implementation of the OneCouncil Performance Planning Local Government module (PPLGS) module was paused due to the City’s resourcing and workload challenges. The module integrates strategic and operational processes to manage risk, compliance, report on KPIs, and includes capturing what, when and who of how the strategic and operational processes will be achieved, capturing and monitoring actions, and providing analytics dashboards.

Recommencement of the PPLGS module implementation is scheduled for late 2025 (subsequent to phase 3 and subject to future resourcing and budgeting considerations) and will facilitate a structured risk management and compliance management framework. This would also include automating the internal audit validation workplan actions and tasks, with start dates, commentary, review trail, supporting documentation attachments, and the person responsible.

**Consultation**

Nil.

**Budget/Financial Implications**

The decision will require resources for the tender process, including the review and evaluation of proposals, but may lead to more efficient use of resources in the long term by addressing key risk areas.

**Decision Implications**

Issuing a publicly advertised tender ensures transparency in the procurement process, providing equal opportunity for all qualified auditors to submit proposals. The City can also secure competitive pricing and potentially obtain better value for the services rendered.

**Conclusion**

It is recommended that a publicly advertised tender request be issued, with the internal audit scope focusing on addressing high-risk areas, strategic risks, governance, and continuous improvements.

# CONFIDENTIAL – Information, Communication & Technology

## 10.1 ARC 60.03.25 Annual External Financial Controls Audit – ICT Findings Update (Confidential)

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Meeting & Date** | Audit Committee Meeting – 17 March 2025 |
| **Applicant** | City of Nedlands |
| **Employee Disclosure under section 5.70 Local Government Act 1995** | Employee disclosure required where there is an interest in any matter of which the employee is providing advice or a report. |
| **Report Author** | D. Hile - Manager ICT |
| **Director** | A. Alderson – Director Corporate Services |
| **Attachments** | Nil. |

**Recommendation**

That the Audit Committee vote to go behind closed doors

**Voting Requirement**

Simple majority

# Any Other Business

Committee Members can raise any other business for discussion at the discretion of the Presiding Member.

# Date of Next Meeting

The date of the next meeting of the Audit Committee Meeting is 14 April 2025.

# Declaration of Closure

There being no further business, the Presiding Member will declare the meeting closed.